

Session 3B - Building the right to the city through diverse spaces of commoning: which role for ruling frameworks?

14:30 - 16:00 Friday, 17th June, 2022

Room Room 126 IULM

Chair Giovanni Allegretti, Edésio Fernandes, Nelson Saule Jr., Lorena Zarate

This session will be divided into two: at 11:30-13:00 (room 132 IULM) and at 14:30-16:00 (room 126 IULM)

The Right to the City (R2C) may be viewed as an “elastic” concept, under permanent construction. Born within a philosophical environment in the 1960s, it includes distinct measures and varying degrees of intensity that are of growing importance in the practice of international socio-political action.

A variety of actors have embraced this “umbrella notion”, interpreting it through different practices which recognise, value and deepen the role of commons as activators of networks of relations (commoning) focussed on enforcing and consolidating a large platform of individual/collective rights.

Given the risk that the notion could be strongest as a socio-political banner and a call to political action rather than as an actual right in itself, this session aims to explore, in depth, the nature, possibilities and limitations of the Right to the City from a socio-legal perspective. Participants are challenged to reflect on the contribution of territorial projects (institutional, grassroots-driven or hybrid) in refining and consolidating the concept of R2C and its multiple dimensions. Organisers are particularly interested in analysing all “ruling” frameworks (of different legal and normative types), which can be associated with the conception of such projects, and can contribute to strengthening the gradual process of clarification of the legal implications of R2C.

The guiding questions of this session include:

- (1) How much the creation of spaces of civic participation between inhabitants, and their dialogue with institutional decision-making, can contribute to the strengthening and better definition of the R2C?
- (2) Who is entitled to claim the R2C?
- (3) Whose duty is it to comply with this claim, and what happens if the right is not complied with?
- (4) How do the different conceptions of the access to land and housing influence the transformation of the right to the city?
- (5) How is the relationship between urban and rural territories evolving in the incremental transformation of the approaches to R2C? (6) How is the R2C being transformed in the light of the phenomenon of metropolization?

3B.6 "Participation and Institutionalization: perspectives in urban policies"

Isabella Rusconi Architect and Urban Planner | Master in Regional and Urban Planning | Phd Candidate¹,
Fernando Nogueira Assistant Professor [ORCID iD](#)²

¹DINÂMIA'CET Centro de Estudos sobre a Mudança Socioeconómica e o Território ISCTE - Instituto Universitário de Lisboa, Portugal. ²Department of Social, Political and Territorial Sciences (DCSPT) | University of Aveiro, Portugal

Extended Abstract

The democratic crisis expressed by high electoral abstention, distrust in political system and rise of authoritarianism signals the importance of bringing citizens back to the political debate (Fung, 2015).

Several authors argue that the renovation of democracy will take place around the political debate about cities, while undergoing intense transformations (Falanga, 2020). It is urgent to rethink participation in urban policies and the evolution of planning instruments and methodologies, helping to confront the decision making with the reality of socio-economic inequalities and environmental imbalances that accompany urban development.

Although the urban political discourse contemplates participation, the existing instruments prove to be ineffective and expose known problems. Literature indicates that the effectiveness of participation arises from

the interactive dynamics between institutional design - referring to norms and procedures that determine in what, who, how and when one participates, to contextual elements - which include social capital, political will, management implementation capacity and governance issues (Avritzer, 2008; Smith, 2009).

The challenges imposed on institutional arrangements relate the need to articulate social and institutional innovation (Avritzer & De Sousa Santos, 2002) for the construction of a new inclusive urban agenda, which addresses territorial problems from a proximity scale, able to transform relations between society and government, and transfer decision-making to citizens in the co-construction of solutions that guarantee the right to the city.

Portugal has been experiencing an explosion of initiatives with different institutional designs, that promote civic participation in direct transformative processes, such as the BIPZIP in Lisbon, the 'Bairros Saudáveis' on a national scale and participatory budgeting; initiatives that can promote public participation in decision-making processes in spatial planning instruments and, recently, the Lisbon Citizens' Council 'by lot'.

Despite this dynamic context, there is no evidence of a coherent system of participation, nor of how and if these practices dialogue with each other, and what is the real impact on urban and territorial development (Falanga & Ferrão, 2021).

If there are fragile systems evaluating the effectiveness and societal impacts of these initiatives, the absence of institutionalized arenas make the sustainability of these practices compromised and vulnerable to political will.

This is an early-stage PhD research that seeks to contribute through a critical reflection on the need for approaches that overcome current barriers to participation in the production of cities. The process is of an applied nature, with a qualitative and practice-oriented approach. The objective is exploratory.

The hypothesis that arises is that democratic innovations can happen in articulation between practices that allow the emergence of social innovation and the institutionalization of participation in decision-making processes.

It is proposed to develop a theoretical framework contemplating the dimensions of analysis to which planning projects and participation arrangements may be subject, which will be comparatively analysed and characterized in the light of the theoretical framework. Then, through exploratory research, we will reflect on new arguments that can support improvements in institutional designs, arrangements and methodologies used in participatory processes related to cities and formulate hypotheses for the institutionalization of these practices in urban policies.

Avritzer, L. (2008). Instituições participativas e desenho institucional: Algumas considerações sobre a variação da participação no Brasil democrático. *Opinio Publica*.

Avritzer, L., & De Sousa Santos, B. (2002). Para ampliar o cânone democrático. In *Democratizar a democracia: os caminhos da democracia participativa*. Civilização Brasileira.

Falanga, R. (2020). *Participatory Design: Participatory Urban Management*. January.

Falanga, R., & Ferrão, J. (2021). The evaluation of citizen participation in policymaking: Insights from Portugal. *Evaluation and Program Planning*.

Fung, A. (2015). Putting the Public Back into Governance: The Challenges of Citizen Participation and Its Future. *Public Administration Review*.

Smith, G. (2009). *Democratic Innovations: Designing Institutions for Citizen Participation*. Cambridge University Press.

Presentation

Online

3B.7 Limits to the right to (use and modify) the city - a Brazilian case

[Sinara Sandri PhD ORCID iD](#)

Universidade de Coimbra, Portugal

Extended Abstract

To discuss the limits of the right to city and the new social actors demands, we bring an autonomous experience of regeneration of a viaduct in the central region of Porto Alegre (Brazil). The city has governments that acts voraciously on public goods and make concessions of parks and green areas for commercial exploitation.

The research, carried out between 2018 and 2019, has an interdisciplinary approach (communication, sociology and urbanism) about materiality of the city as a trigger for space production. A road structure provided shelter for three types of occupation: a) philanthropic - PF das Ruas - distribution of food to the vulnerable population by 180 volunteers; b) cultural - Samba de Tuesday - night event that promoted interaction between different social sectors; c) sports - street skaters whose activity included the location in the city's sports circuit.

Skaters were the first to arrive, built small obstacles for maneuvers and made free and random use of space. The movement made that place, used as a passage and parking lot, be perceived as usable for coexistence. The toponymy was changed and Brooklyn was inscribed on the city map.

In the wake, came the PF and Samba de Tuesday, which used simple structures that were completely removed after use, had a fixed schedule and coordination. Only Samba de Terça tried to dialogue with the municipality to regularize the event and the sale of drinks. The other two groups were keen to stay away from the authorities.

The public movement and the noise of cultural events disturbed the neighborhood. Samba de Terça has already started in an unfavorable context, but the perception was positive with journalistic articles reporting the integration of the viaduct into the samba route in the capital. With the intensification of the 2018 presidential race, Brooklyn became a place of anti-fascist resistance and political demonstrations, one being held by sambistas. Two days after the victory of Jair Bolsonaro, the negotiation for the adjustment of conduct that had been coordinated by the Public Ministry was closed and the event was suspended by decision of the organizers.

Samba tried new locations until it withered away. The skaters had some of their obstacles destroyed by an action by the municipal government, while the city hall granted part of the waterfront for the construction of a skate park for international competitions. Volunteers follow their philanthropic action and, in 2022, invited Samba members to charity musical events during the distribution of food.

The occupations worked in resonance for the regeneration of the viaduct and form an example of space production based on common use value. The city offers material structures that can both shelter invisibilities and provoke experiences that reopen the possibilities of using these spaces. In some cases, these autonomous regenerative actions put tension on urban rules, demonstrating the feasibility of reinventing uses, creating new behavioral contents and alliances that do not fit in a segregated space. Furthermore, the autonomous economic occupation of public spaces is a counterpoint to the monetization provided by the state. The acceptance was inverse to the differentiation of the typology of occupation foreseen for the area. Faced with the conflict, the municipal administration ignored the attempt to regularize it as a cultural event while applying coercion to repress irregular commerce. The case demonstrates a strategy to stop the redistribution of spaces in the city and to regulate precariousness.

SANDRI, Sinara. Brooklyn - Comunicação e Insurgência na cidade de Porto Alegre. Tese doutorado. Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul. Programa de Pós-Graduação em Comunicação e Informação. Porto Alegre, 2020.

Presentation

Online

3B.8 Beyond urban-rural linkages, the defense of territories and cities for life

Rubén Paredes Cortez, Vanessa Pinto Valencia, [Diana Bell Sancho](#), Gabriela Vacacela Marquez, Lucía Ruiz Pozo
Contrato Social por la Vivienda, Ecuador

Extended Abstract

This panel presents the contents of a thematic research paper that addresses one of the components of the Right to the City: "cities and human settlements with inclusive urban-rural linkages". For its elaboration, a process of research, critical analysis and collective discussion was carried out between the group of authors of the Contrato Social por la Vivienda Ecuador and the members of the Global Platform for the Right to the City (GP4RC) working group on "cities and human settlements with inclusive urban-rural linkages": André Biazoti (Instituto Polis) Emily Mattheisen (FIAN), Judith Hitchman and Isa Álvarez (URGENCI), Sri Husnaini Sofjan (Huairou Commission). The methodology applied combined an examination of critical development theory and case studies, and included a participatory component where input was received from grassroots activists and scholars via an international webinar organized by GP4RC. The text is structured in four sections: the first section makes a critical reading of the current context denouncing how the colonialist, capitalist, anthropocentric and patriarchal model that has been imposed globally annihilates the possibilities of life on the planet and generates inequities, environmental deterioration, violence and uncertainty. At the same time, we analyze the response to this reality from the perspective of global development agendas promoted by international organizations, particularly examining how the 2030 Sustainable Development Goals, the Paris Agreement and the New Urban Agenda address the axis of urban-rural linkages. In the second section, a brief review of the Right to the City framework is presented, identifying links with other conceptual approaches and social practices framed in the vindication of Human Rights and the Rights of Nature. It highlights the need for a new approach for considering urban-rural linkages through the articulation of the Right to the City, Human Rights and the Rights of Nature frameworks. The third section presents several case studies that put into practice transformative actions at different scales and with diverse linkages of actors, demonstrating how other ways of acting and relating to territories and cities are possible, recovering them as places for the regeneration of life. These practices revolve around four axes proposed as central to the themes addressed in the document: 1. responsible production and consumption 2. The solidarity economy, 3. food sovereignty, 4. the defense and care of territories in the context of movements for environmental justice. To conclude, a series of public policy recommendations are proposed to strengthen alternative actions in the aforementioned lines of focus, as well as general recommendations to transform how local and national governments approach land use planning and territorial management.

Presentation

Online

3B.9 Adoption of Inclusive planning governance in religious events during pandemic - Case of Rath Yatra, Odisha "

Shradha Chandan PHD Candidate [ORCID iD](#)¹, Dr. Satish Pipralia², Dr. Ashwani Kumar³

¹MNIT Jaipur, India. ²Associate Professor, MNIT Jaipur, India. ³Asst. Professor, MNIT Jaipur, India

Extended Abstract

India has numerous cities with religious sentiments and heritage values and diverse cultures and traditions in every state. From the Char Dhams in four corners to the ancient Kashi, India, the land of rich history and spirituality, is blessed with religious beauty. One of the primary motivations of the tourist pilgrims to frequent these destinations is the immense socio-cultural value of its intangible heritage in the form of festivals and religious events. They hold significant value in the history and propagation of the culture and traditions in the pilgrim cities. From Kumbh Mela in various sacred cities to Ganesh Chaturthi in Maharashtra, multiple events of these statures were not able to occur due to the pandemic. These led to a massive outcry among religious sects and made the state consider the necessity to adapt the events with modifications suited to the contemporary scenario. This research adopts the case study references to understand innovations in multi-level governance to tackle the urban heritage challenges and experiences during the ongoing COVID Crisis.

The study was undertaken in Puri, Odisha, which holds an annual Rath Yatra festival, gathering about ten lakh pilgrims each year which was inconceivable in the COVID crisis. The coastal city of Odisha, on the banks of the Bay of Bengal, Puri enjoys a unique position in the history for its enigmatic Jagganath culture, tradition, and its immense heritage. The Rath Yatra is the only festival where deities are taken out of temples to travel among the devotees, and Puri hosts the largest chariot procession in the world. It also inflows around 10-30 lakhs of the floating population during significant festivals, 'Ratha Yatra' and 'Naba Kalebara,' to witness the grandeur of Lord Jagannath and its traditions. Others Festivals of importance are Suna besha, Naba jaovan Besha, Snana Besha, and Bahuda yatra, which marks the end of Ratha Yatra, the annual Car festival. It is high time to evaluate and address them in ways that reflect the great diversity of cultural traditions, support new practices, and define management systems to preserve values within sustainable processes. This research aims to understand the influence of intangible heritage on the urban planning of the temple town in contemporary times, primarily focusing on the pandemic scenario. Rath Yatra, the nine-day festival, celebrates the annual journey of Lord Jagannath and his siblings to the Gundicha Temple, around 2.5 km away. The festival was conducted during the pandemic through modified interventions that facilitated less footfall but maximized engagement and participation. Based on Primary and secondary data, this study delves into the local governmental policies undertaken in Puri to execute the annual car festival and identifies future scope in urban conservation in the face of disaster risks and pandemics.

The research identified that one of the crucial stakeholders in the pilgrim cities, Priests, was involved in the festival's entire functioning with the state, district, and municipal administrations. They conducted the rituals regarding the Rath Yatra within the temple premises to limit the community mass. The Municipal authorities strictly enforced the curfew and transportation guidelines under Disaster Management Act, 2005, and COVID-19 Regulations 2020. Various challenges and opportunities have also been identified through comparison with other case studies of different contexts and other festivals across India. The research concludes by recognizing that the communities' synergy and participation in living heritage should be crucial for sustainable resilience, especially community involvement and awareness generation, particularly among the vulnerable segments of the population.

Presentation

Online

3B.4 Analyzing Inclusive Citizenship in Cities and Human Settlements through a Right to the City perspective.

Kelly Komatsu Agopyan PhD student
University of São Paulo, Brazil

Extended Abstract

This thematic paper, elaborated in the scope of the Global Platform for the Right to the City (GPR2C) aims to address the main aspects of inclusive citizenship in cities and human settlements, as well as its main contributions to the promotion of the right to the city. The paper discusses different interpretations of inclusive citizenship - which is a dynamic and contested concept - hoping to provide a better understanding of its complexity, implications, and relevance in cities and human settlements.

Firstly, it is relevant to contextualize the concept of "citizenship". The more disseminated notion of citizenship is a state-centric one, related to two main approaches: citizen as a (civil, political, and cultural) rights holder and citizen as having collective responsibilities and duties (LISTER, 2003). The alternative perspective, in its turn, acknowledges that there are different ways to be a citizen, and that citizenship is a condition that goes beyond the civic and political practices (ALVAREZ, 2017, p.02), aiming at turning citizenship an effective inclusive practice.

One of the components that can be considered in reconfiguring the meaning of citizenship is "agency". It is related to the possibility of individuals to be purposeful and creative in the political arena, being effectively agents of choice (LISTER, 2003). This concept, which is frequently mobilized by black feminists, indigenous peoples, and youth movements, emphasizes the struggle for recognizing the agency of marginalized groups, to be recognized as subjects, not objects, of policies and decision making. Thus, various authors highlight that this concept does not refer to the capacity to act in searching for individual benefits, but it has a collective empowering sense. In that way, promoting human agency initiatives can be achieved by:

- Acknowledging the right of vulnerable groups to choose and stipulate their own preferences and needs.
- Valuing and considering the contributions of all groups to the collective decision-making.
- Creating safe spaces of active listening to the vulnerable groups demanding and giving suggestions.
- Promoting communication strategies to empower and amplify the voice of vulnerable groups in the community.
- Advocating for vulnerable groups representatives' participation in spaces of power and public events.

In conclusion, citizenship should be pursued by a collective perspective to be inclusive. It is not the grant of an individual citizen right, but a collective one, also proposed and established by the collectivity. In that way, all groups that reside, circulate and work in the city, which are part of this urban community, should be able to have their rights fully established, acknowledged as subjects of choice and needs, and empowered to interfere in the production and transformation of their community.

ALVAREZ, Lucia. Ciudadanía, construcción de Ciudadanía y Ciudad. In: Eibenschutz. Roberto; Carlos Lavore (coord.). La ciudad como cultura: líneas estratégicas de política pública para la Ciudad de México. Ed. Debate/ UAM/CDMX, México, 2017.

LISTER, Ruth. Citizenship: Feminist Perspectives. Palgrave Macmillan, 2nd edition, 2003.

MC2CM; UCLG (edit.). Peer Learning Note 28 - Local Citizenship and Migration: Fostering the right to the city for all. 2021.

Presentation

Online